

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

J. CARTER BROWN, Chairman

PHILIP W. BUCHEN

FREDERICK D. NICHOLS

VICTORINE DU PONT HOMSEY

KEVIN ROCHE

ELI S. JACOBS

EDWARD D. STONE, JR.

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

708 JACKSON PLACE, N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20006
202-566-1066

MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
31 January, 1979

AM

1:00 CONVENE, 708 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C.

I. ADMINISTRATION:

A. Dates of next meetings: 21 February, 1979
27 March, 1979
24, April, 1979

B. Minutes of December, 1979 meeting.

C. Rosslyn Skyline, U.S. vs Arlington County and Developers.

II. SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS:

A. General Services Administration

F.B.I. free standing courtyard sculpture by Frederick Shady Jr.

B. District of Columbia Department of General Services

Preliminary designs of D.C. Civic Center at 9th and New York Avenue, N.W.

C. District of Columbia Department of Housing and Community Development

Fort Lincoln New Open Space Plan.

D. Smithsonian Institution

Renwick Gallery of Art - Access for Handicapped.

E. District of Columbia, Department of Economic Development

1. Old Georgetown Act

- a. O.G. 79-35, 1050 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.
Resubmission, Construct new office, apartment
and garage building.
- b. O.G. 79-39, 3251 K Street, N.W.
Papermill window details.
- c. O.G. 79-45, 1023 31st Street, N.W.
Resubmission - New Construction.
- d. O.G. 79-46, 1609-11 31st Street, N.W.
Demolition of two apartment buildings,
preliminary design, eight new free-
standing town houses.
- e. O.G. 79-47, 48, 49, 1234 31st Street, N.W.
Hamilton Arms, renovation of existing buildings.
- f. Appendix 1.

2. Shipstead-Luce Act

- a. Square 291, 12th and Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
New office building.
- b. Appendix 2.

3. Historic Subdivision

- a. Appendix 3.

F. Pennsylvania Avenue Development Corporation

Inspection of lighting mock-up between 7th Street, S.W.
and Titanic Memorial.

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON THE OLD GEORGETOWN ACT

NO.	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
* OG 79- 34	1023 31st Street, N.W. Theodore Manousakis	New Construction
ACTION: Do not issue permit. Though design development of this proposed building appears to be moving in the right direction, the Commission is still of the opinion that the building is two floors too high in relation to low scale adjacent townhouses. Recommend restudy at a lower height.		
* 36	37th and O Street, N.W. Georgetown University	Intercultural Center
ACTION: Do not issue permit. Preliminary scheme is recommended for additional design development and resubmission. Commission requests opportunity to review detailed design studies utilizing sight lines and appearance of proposed project from views along river as well as the Historic District.		
40	Rear 1073 Wisconsin Ave., N.W. Blues Alley	New Entrance
ACTION: Do not issue permit. Cutting new vestibule into existing stable type doors is not recommended. This would obliterate a substantial part of the historic character of this building and its surroundings. Recommend alternative study. Suggest internal enlargement of existing vestibule to accommodate two means of egress. See drawings.		
42	2813 Dumbarton St., N.W. Michael Lambert	Addition to existing structure-raze part of existing structure which is about to fall.
ACTION: Issue Permit.		
43	1699 31st Street, N.W. D.E. Mitchel	Erect wood board fence behind existing iron fence.
ACTION: Recommend issuance of permit provided new fence is painted to match trim of house or is painted to match trim of house or is painted a dark green, grey or earth color. Recommend against white or other very light colors.		

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON THE OLD GEORGETOWN BOARD

<u>NO.</u>	<u>ADDRESS AND OWNER</u>	<u>PROJECT</u>
OG 79- 44	3307 M Street, N.W. Pier I Imports	New Sign.

ACTION: Do not issue permit. See previous action. Bracket lights not recommended.

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON THE SHIPSTEAD-LUCE ACT

<u>NO.</u>	<u>ADDRESS AND OWNER</u>	<u>PROJECT</u>
* SL 79-6	200 South Carolina Ave., S.E. Capitol Hill Day School	Restore front entrance, add new doors rebuild and change direction of rear stairs add new skylight to existing roof.
<u>ACTION: Issue Permit.</u>		
8	201 East Capitol Street, S.E. Folger Shakespeare Library	Interior remodeling; exterior repairs and alterations.
<u>ACTION: Issue permit.</u>		
9	30 E Street, S.W. C&P Telephone Co.	Remove portion of existing limestone facing and install two 8' antennae at main roof. Not visible from exterior except on south.
<u>ACTION: Issue Permit.</u>		

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON HISTORIC SUBDIVISION

NO.ADDRESS AND OWNERPROJECT

HS 117

34th Street & Water Street, N.W.

Proposed subdivision of part of original
lots 32-34 into one record lot.

Square 1184

Carson and Gruman

ACTION: No objection.

HS 122

2813 Dumbarton Street, N.W.

Proposed subdivision of part of original
lots 128 & 129 into one record lot.

Square 1240

Michael T. Lambert

ACTION: No objection.

HS 127

3315 Q Street, N.W.

Rear of residential, rear lot surrounded
by public property for proposed addition,
not visible from public space.

Square 1278

Diana Mae Richards

ACTION: No objection.

LIST OF PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES ATTENDING THE
COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS MEETING

January 31, 1979

General Services Administration

Dale Thompson

1023 31st Street, N.W.

Basil Rousos

District of Columbia Department of
of General Services

Bob Gordon

1609-11 31st Street, N.W.

Charles B. Soulét
Lawrence N. Brandt

District of Columbia Department of
Housing and Community Development

Arnold Mays *Tim*

1234 31st St., N.W.-Hamilton Arms

Richard Stauffer

Smithsonian Institution

John Murphy

12th and Pennsylvania Avenue, S.W.

David Childs

1050 Thomas Jefferson St., N.W.

Vlastimil Koubek

Pennsylvania Avenue Development Corp.

Lee Alan *Lee*

3251 K Street, N.W.

Elliott Gitlin

Old Georgetown Board Member

Thomas W. D. Wright

LIST OF PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES ATTENDING THE
COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS MEETING

General Services Administration

Jack Loxley
Jimmy Stewart
Jerry Karnes

3218 Volta Place, N.W.

Robert Bell

3031, 3043, 3045 K Street, N.W.

Pennsylvania Avenue Development
Corporation

Andy Barnes
Lee Alan
Robert Venturi
Paul Friedberg
Jerry Lindsey

Nathan Landow
Elliot Gitlin
Nancy Noyes

2112 F Street

Elliot Gitlin

National Park Service, National
Capital Region

Joe Ronsisvalle

1201 Pennsylvania Avenue

David Childs
Jim Groupe

National Academy of Science

Wilson Darrow
Mark Feist
Lavern Nielsen

4550 Broad Branch Road

Bruce Preston

Lincoln Memorial - Tourmobile

Jack Fish
John Parsons

U.S. Treasury Department

George Schaeffer

F.B.I. Sculpture

Dale Thompson

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
31 January, 1979

The meeting convened at 1:15 p.m. in the Commission of Fine Arts offices at 708 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C.

Members Present: Hon. J. Carter Brown, Chairman
 Hon. Philip W. Buchen
 Hon. Victorine Du Pont Homsey
 Hon. Frederick D. Nichols
 Hon. Kevin Roche
 Hon. Edward D. Stone, Jr.

Georgetown Board
Member Present: Mr. Thomas D. Wright

Staff Present: Mr. Charles H. Atherton, Secretary
 Mr. Donald B. Myer, Assistant Secretary
 Mrs. Elizabeth Bemis
 Mr. Jeffrey R. Carson
 Mrs. Sue A. Kohler
 Miss Barbara Tatge

I. ADMINISTRATION:

A. Minutes of December 1978 meeting, approved.

B. Dates of next meetings, approved as: 20 February, 1979
 27 March, 1979
 24 April, 1979

C. Rosslyn Skyline, U.S. vs Arlington County and Developers:
The Secretary reported that the staff had prepared a number of exhibits for the trial held 22 January, 1979 and that the Chairman had testified as an expert witness. He said that Judge Lewis will hear further oral arguments on the 8th of February and will then make his decision. He also noted that the Arland Towers permit will come up for renewal soon and said that the National Park Service and the NCPC will appear at the Arlington County Board meeting to oppose it. He asked if the Commission members wanted to place a statement before the County Board commenting on the design and the current lawsuit. Mr. Buchen thought that since the Commission has no jurisdiction in Arlington County, it would be better just to supplement the other agencies' statements if they request it.

II. SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS

A. General Services Administration. F.B.I. free-standing sculpture by Frederick Shrady, Jr.: The Secretary informed the members that representatives of the F.B.I. organization sponsoring the sculpture were present to give the Commission a progress report. Mr. Dale Thompson then showed photographs of a full scale model in a nearly completed state. He said his organization was pleased with the three figures representing Fidelity, Bravery and Integrity, but had yet to see the flag which is to be placed behind them in its final form. In response to a question, he said the total height would be 16'-4". Mr. Thompson asked the Commission for some guidance in selecting a color for the bronze patina; the Chairman said he would prefer a dark color with lighter highlights, and the other members concurred.

The sculptor, Frederick Shrady, Jr., was introduced and showed additional photographs with two versions of the flag. It was generally agreed that the one in which it is raised above the ground would be preferable. The Chairman expressed his feeling that it would be impossible to approve the sculpture on the basis of these photographs alone, and thought that the model should be seen by the members of the Commission and that further study was required. At the request of the other members, the Chairman and the Secretary agreed to pursue the matter further with the sculptor and the F.B.I. representatives.

EXHIBIT A

B. District of Columbia Department of General Services. Preliminary designs of the D.C. Civic Center at 9th and New York Avenue, N.W.: The Assistant Secretary recalled that the Commission had seen this project several years ago and said that it was now being resubmitted in a simpler and less expensive form. He noted also that there had been a change in site: the center will now span the area from 9th to 11th Streets between H Street and New York Avenue, N.W.; formerly it was sited between 8th and 10th between H and New York.

A representative from the office of Welton Becket and Associates, Architects, explained that the building has been considerably simplified because there is no longer a need to keep 9th Street open and bridge over it. He described the proposed two story buildings, arranged with circulation and meeting space on the ground floor and flexible exhibit space above. 250,00 square feet of exhibit space would be provided. He noted that the mass of the structure has been reduced and the size of the ground floor meeting space cut in size. Another change has been the relocation of the truck entrance, from H to New York Avenue, thus avoiding the need for a ramp and bringing about a better relationship between the

building and the pedestrian traffic along H Street. This elevation will now provide for retail shops and a lobby which will continue around to the 9th Street side. Entrance to the large, 11,000 seat ground floor meeting space will be at the 11th Street corner, and parking will be provided for 300 cars. It is presumed that the majority of people using the center will come via public transportation or taxi.

The elevation drawings showed an attempt to break up the mass of the building through the use of varied heights and a glazed space frame at roof level. The average height is 60 feet, with greater height on New York Avenue - a maximum of 75 feet. Exterior materials are expected to be grey glass for the lobby area and space frame glazing and precast, vertically striated, exposed aggregate concrete for the other wall areas.

The Chairman asked the architect if he had considered any material other than concrete - perhaps metal - and said that it is important to achieve the lightest effect possible. Mr. Roche suggested consideration of the same kind of glass the Becket firm had used previously in a Dallas hotel. The architect said much thought had been given to the material and while he did not think it would appear too heavy, he would explore other possibilities. The basic concept and massing were approved.

C. District of Columbia Department of Housing and Community Development. Fort Lincoln new open space plan: Staff member Jeffrey Carson explained that this ongoing project had been seen by the Commission previously, and that the recommendations had been that in all future plans, attention should be given to the overall views and existing trees. At this time the agency is requesting approval of changes in the open space plan. The major changes would be an increase in the size of the lake, from 330 to 660 feet across, and the relocation, farther south, of the roadway through the park area. Mr. Alan Pearson of the landscape architecture firm of Paul Freiberg and Associates discussed the plan. The changes in the site plan were approved, but there was some concern over the angularity of the walks and lake configuration, and Mr. Stone thought that the Commission should see a topographical model.

D. Smithsonian Institution. Renwick Gallery of Art - access for the handicapped: Mr. McGaughan, the architect, was introduced by the Secretary. He explained that the proposed handicapped access could be easily accommodated through the use of a ramp placed in an existing areaway on the 17th Street side. It would be entered through an opening in the iron fence at the 17th Street and Pennsylvania Avenue corner and lead to an entrance at basement level. The members had no objection after seeing the drawings and the project was approved.

E. District of Columbia, Department of Economic Development

1. Old Georgetown Act

a. O.G. 79-35, 1050 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W. Resubmission, construct new office, apartment and garage building. The Assistant Secretary reviewed the Commission's previous recommendations for this project, which included a reduction in height and bulk and a simplification of the design. He introduced architect Vlastimil Koubek who explained his revisions, noting that the Commission had recommended that the height not exceed 60 feet. Mr. Thompson Wright of the Georgetown Board said the Board felt that the new design was more residential in character but still not as good as it could be. The Board members were concerned with the appearance of the high, blank wall to the south and made the recommendation that the building be lowered one floor and the terrace continued around the south side.

Mr. Koubek explained that because the building is narrow and deep, he would have problems continuing the terrace or adding more windows on the south and still provide enough wall and closet space.

Mr. Donald Shannon, representing the ANC 3A, and architect Grosvenor Chapman both expressed reservations about the overall size of the project and the blank south wall.

The Commission thought that breaking up the 31st Street facade vertically gave an unpleasant tower-like effect, and that perhaps making the bays only three stories high - similar to Victorian houses - might solve the problem. Mr. Nichols was concerned with the institutional appearance and thought it needed a more domestic quality. All agreed that the building needed more study and it was not approved.

b. O.G. 79-39, 3251 K Street, N.W. Papermill window details. The Assistant Secretary explained that this submission was for redesign of window openings to meet the Commission's recommendation that existing openings and type of sash be kept as much as possible. He said that this has been done, with the exception of large openings where Thermopane is desirable. As this type of glazing will not accommodate the mullions originally used, the architect has asked that he be given approval to eliminate them. The members had no objections to the drawings as submitted, and the window designs were approved.

c. O.G. 79-45, 1023 31st Street, N.W. Resubmission, new construction. The Assistant reviewed the Commission's previous recommendations, which were that the building be further reduced in

height and bulk. Mr. Wright of the Georgetown Board said that while the members would prefer to have no building of this size on the site, they thought the present design an improvement over previous submissions. The total height has been reduced to 56 feet with an apparent height of 46'-7". The architect, Basil Rousos, pointed out that windows have been omitted at ground level on the north wall, in order to preserve the privacy of the townhouse gardens. He also said that he is considering the use of a limestone cornice at roughly the height of the townhouses so that this domestic height and scale would be continued visually along the facade of the new building. The members did not think the use of a contrasting material would be a good idea and suggested that the same effect could be achieved simply by setting the upper arcade back a short distance. It was also recommended that windows on the third floor be the same size as those on the second, instead of larger. The project was not approved.

d. O.G. 79-46, 1609-11 31st Street, N.W. Demolition of two apartment buildings, preliminary design, eight new free standing townhouses. The Assistant Secretary described the site, its proximity to Tudor Place across the street, the early frame house to the north and the large, late Victorian brick houses to the south, all set back from the street on a steep bank. Mr. Wright said that the Georgetown Board was concerned about the character of the houses proposed and the breaking of the bank along the street. The architect Charles Soule, described the siting of the houses. Three would face 31st Street with garages in front; the other five would be built behind these with parking on the alley which forms the northern boundary of the site. The material would be brick, of various kinds, some painted, with flat, pitched or Dutch roofs.

Several tenants of the apartments spoke in favor of keeping the buildings, saying that they provided housing for middle income people and help preserve the diversity characteristic of Georgetown. The members felt that on the basis of what they had seen the proposed project did not have sufficient merit to justify razing structures which are good examples of the Georgian Revival of over a half century ago, with certain skillfully handled details recording the architectural character of Georgetown in its initial years. The demolition request was not approved.

e. O.G. 79-47, 48, 49; 1234 31st Street, N.W. Hamilton Arms, renovation of existing buildings. The Assistant Secretary reviewed previous submissions for this project and said that this submission was for approval of renovations to the old parish house, Bell Telephone building, and some alley structures on the property. The work would consist of new sash, blocking of some openings, and alterations to porches. Mr. Wright reported that the Georgetown Board had no objection

to this work. Richard Stauffer, the architect, said the work in the parish house would consist basically of repairs; the telephone company building will need a new roof, and rear porches would be repaired and closed in with a one story addition above. Recent window openings cut in the side elevation would be blocked up and new front doors installed. The large front windows would be glazed with Thermopane and, therefore, the present mullions would be eliminated. Drawings of proposed window treatment in the alley buildings showed larger expanses of glass than the Commission felt were appropriate.

Mr. Stauffer emphasized the need of beginning repair work immediately. Neighbors and tenants agreed, with tenants and their architect stressing that the work should consist solely of repair and not involve remodeling or new construction. The renovations for the parish house were approved, as were those for the telephone company building, with the exception of eliminating a large triangular window in the wall of the new addition and replacing it with a skylight. The proposals for the alley buildings were not approved, and a resubmission was suggested using smaller areas of glass.

f. Appendix 1, approved.

2. Shipstead-Luce Act

a. Square 291. 12th and Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. New office building. The Assistant Secretary introduced Mr. David Childs, architect, from the firm of Skidmore, Owings and Merrill. Mr. Childs stated that this project is still in a very preliminary stage, and this submission was intended for information only. He added that the PADC had seen this presentation. The building, basically trapezoidal, would follow the angle of Pennsylvania Avenue, respecting the 50 foot setback, and maintain the orthogonal grid of E Street in the rear. To the west it abuts the existing Pennsylvania Building, which is not likely to be razed. The drawings showed a central atrium which opens out onto Pennsylvania Avenue to a height of four stories. It will rise the full height of the building on the interior, becoming progressively smaller as it rises, and will be roofed by a skylight. Diagonal circulations areas run through the building at ground floor level. Exterior material is expected to be granite. The building will rise to a height of 135 feet, where there will be a 50 foot setback and a continuation up to 160 feet. The members were pleased with this initial presentation and had no objections to the general concept, massing or material.

b. Appendix 2, approved.

3. Historic Subdivision

a. Appendix 3, approved.

F. Pennsylvania Avenue Development Corporation. Inspection of lighting mock-up between 7th Street, S.W. and the Titanic Memorial. Mr. Lee Allen of the PADC told the Commission that there would be a lighting mock-up available for their inspection and said that the Corporation is considering three types of glass, in varying degrees of opacity, for the globes. He also showed a granite sample for curbs and pedestrian islands slightly different from that already in use. It was approved.

EXHIBIT B

The meeting was adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Signed,


Charles H. Atherton

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

708 JACKSON PLACE, N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20006

MEMO FOR THE RECORD:

SUBJECT: Sculptor for Courtyard, FBI Headquarters

Mr. Shrady, the sculptor, and Mr. Dale Thompson representing the Society of Former Agents, dropped by the office on Thursday, February 1, at 9:00 to discuss the Commissions action at its meeting on the previous day. Shrady said he was willing to pursue a more abstract approach in rendering the three figures of the proposed sculpture, but Thompson said there was little hope that his Society's Board of Directors would accept such an approach; they had had lengthy discussions on the same matter on several previous occasions, and in Thompson's opinion, it was fruitless to go over the same ground again.

As a result of this apparent impasse, I suggested that Shrady be allowed to study his designs further with a view toward meeting some of the more obvious criticisms that had been directed toward his design - namely the relatively gaunt and emaciated appearance of the human figures, and the awkward folds of the "clothing" draped on the figures. The flag was also to be tilted a bit to the left, as seen from the front in order to give it a more lively thrust.

Thompson and Shrady both agreed to such a course provided that the Chairman of the Commission had no objection.

I spoke to J. Carter Brown shortly after they had departed, and it was agreed nothing would be lost on at least one more try to salvage the present design.

I called Thompson later that day and relayed the message.

On Friday, February 9th he called back and would like to have Karel Yasko and me see the actual restudy in Shrady's studio in Peekskill, New York on February 27th.

I mentioned this to J. Carter Brown and he concurred.

Charles H. Atherton



Secretary

February 13, 1979

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

J. CARTER BROWN, Chairman

PHILIP W. BUCHEN

FREDERICK D. NICHOLS

VICTORINE DU PONT HOMSLY

KEVIN ROCHE

ELI S. JACOBS

EDWARD D. STONE, JR.

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

703 JACKSON PLACE, N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20006
202-566-1066

Dear Andy:

At the Commission of Fine Arts meeting on January 31st Lee Allen proposed alternate granite with a finer grain for the curb and trim for the sidewalk area near the Commerce Building. The Commission had no objection to the proposal, but would like the exact name of the material for our records.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

Mr. W. Anderson Barnes
Executive Director
Pennsylvania Avenue Development
Corporation
425 13th Street, N.W.
Suite 1148
Washington, D.C. 20004

